

# **EXHIBIT “D”**

**Values reported on Shell's Discharge Monitoring Reports**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Outfall</b>	<b>Parameter</b>	<b>Permit MDL (ug/l)</b>	<b>Value Reported on DMR (ug/l)</b>
7/1/12	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
7/2/12	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/1/12	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/1/12	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/5/12	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/5/12	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/3/12	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/3/12	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
11/8/12	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
11/8/12	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/10/12	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/10/12	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
1/15/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
1/15/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
2/12/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
3/8/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
3/8/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/1/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/1/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/1/13	001A	Benzo[a]anthracene	0.013	<1
4/1/13	001A	Benzo[a]pyrene	0.023	<1
4/1/13	001A	Benzo[b]fluoranthene	0.018	<1
4/1/13	001A	Benzo[k]fluoranthene	0.017	<1
4/1/13	001A	Chrysene	0.15	<1
4/1/13	001A	Dibenzo[a,h]anthracene	0.03	<1
4/1/13	001A	Indeno[1,2,3-cd]pyrene	0.043	<1
4/1/13	002A	Benzo[a]anthracene	0.013	<1
4/1/13	002A	Benzo[a]pyrene	0.023	<1
4/1/13	002A	Benzo[b]fluoranthene	0.018	<1
4/1/13	002A	Benzo[k]fluoranthene	0.017	<1
4/1/13	002A	Chrysene	0.15	<1
4/1/13	002A	Dibenzo[a,h]anthracene	0.03	<1
4/1/13	002A	Indeno[1,2,3-cd]pyrene	0.043	<1
5/10/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
5/10/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/4/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/4/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
7/2/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
7/2/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/9/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/9/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/3/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/3/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/7/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/7/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
11/8/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/3/13	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/3/13	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
1/6/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
2/4/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
2/21/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1

Date	Outfall	Parameter	Permit MDL (ug/l)	Value Reported on DMR (ug/l)
3/20/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
3/20/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/9/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/9/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/9/14	001A	Benzo[a]anthracene	0.013	<1
4/9/14	001A	Benzo[a]pyrene	0.023	<1
4/9/14	001A	Benzo[b]fluoranthene	0.018	<1
4/9/14	001A	Benzo[k]fluoranthene	0.017	<1
4/9/14	001A	Chrysene	0.15	<1
4/9/14	001A	Dibenzo[a,h]anthracene	0.03	<1
4/9/14	001A	Indeno[1,2,3-cd]pyrene	0.043	<1
4/9/14	002A	Benzo[a]anthracene	0.013	<1
4/9/14	002A	Benzo[a]pyrene	0.023	<1
4/9/14	002A	Benzo[b]fluoranthene	0.018	<1
4/9/14	002A	Benzo[k]fluoranthene	0.017	<1
4/9/14	002A	Chrysene	0.15	<1
4/9/14	002A	Dibenzo[a,h]anthracene	0.03	<1
4/9/14	002A	Indeno[1,2,3-cd]pyrene	0.043	<1
5/2/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
5/2/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/6/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/6/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
7/15/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
7/15/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/14/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/14/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/2/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/2/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/2/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/2/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
11/3/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
11/3/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/3/14	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/3/14	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
1/5/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
2/23/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
3/4/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/7/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/7/15	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/7/15	001A	Benzo[a]anthracene	0.013	<1
4/7/15	001A	Benzo[a]pyrene	0.023	<1
4/7/15	001A	Benzo[b]fluoranthene	0.018	<1
4/7/15	001A	Benzo[k]fluoranthene	0.017	<1
4/7/15	001A	Chrysene	0.15	<1
4/7/15	001A	Dibenzo[a,h]anthracene	0.03	<1
4/7/15	001A	Indeno[1,2,3-cd]pyrene	0.043	<1
4/7/15	002A	Benzo[a]anthracene	0.013	<1
4/7/15	002A	Benzo[a]pyrene	0.023	<1
4/7/15	002A	Benzo[b]fluoranthene	0.018	<1
4/7/15	002A	Benzo[k]fluoranthene	0.017	<1
4/7/15	002A	Chrysene	0.15	<1

Date	Outfall	Parameter	Permit MDL (ug/l)	Value Reported on DMR (ug/l)
4/7/15	002A	Dibenzo[a,h]anthracene	0.03	<1
4/7/15	002A	Indeno[1,2,3-cd]pyrene	0.043	<1
5/13/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/1/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/1/15	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/12/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
8/12/15	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/11/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/11/15	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/13/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
10/13/15	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
11/12/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
11/12/15	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/2/15	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
12/2/15	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
1/11/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
1/11/16	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
2/4/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
2/4/16	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
3/2/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
3/2/16	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/5/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
4/5/16	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
5/3/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
5/3/16	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/6/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
6/6/16	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
7/5/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/2/16	001A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
9/2/16	002A	Total Xylenes	0.5	<1
<b>TOTAL VIOLATIONS</b>				<b>132</b>

\*We were unable to obtain the July 2015 DMR for the Providence Terminal. Information contained within this DMR may reveal additional violations.